



March 4, 2020

To: Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition (NOAC)
From: Palmer Energy Company
Subject: RFP Refresh Results for NOAC Electric Aggregation Renewal

As the authorized energy consultant for the Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition (NOAC), Palmer Energy issued an RFP for electric pricing for residential and small commercial customers in 15 communities across Northwest Ohio. The RFP was composed of over 140,000 meters and approximately 1.3 TWh annually. All communities included are receiving electric distribution service from FirstEnergy – Toledo Edison.

This RFP was sent to 14 suppliers and each respondent was asked to provide pricing beginning when the current contracts are set to expire for terms of 12, 24, and 36 months. Five suppliers responded to the initial RFP with varying prices, structures, and additional benefits for participants. Refreshed pricing was requested from AEP Energy, Dynegy, and Energy Harbor (formerly FirstEnergy Solutions). The table summarizes the refreshed “base” price offers from each respondent. All offers meet the following specifications:

- 1. Fixed means fixed price structure
2. No early termination fees (ETF) for participants who choose to leave the program at any time
3. No community grants
4. State standard renewable portfolio standards (RPS)

Table with 6 columns: Supplier, Term (Months), Rate (\$/kWh), Est. Average Residential Customer Annual Save, Est. Average Commercial Customer Annual Save, Est. Total Annual Community Save. Rows include FES / Energy Harbor, AEP Energy, and Dynegy.

The table above details the price offers received and displays the estimated annual savings potential for average individual residential and small commercial customers as well as the aggregation as a whole. Please Note: Estimated savings are based upon the estimated annual utility Price-to-Compare (PTC) figures. These PTC numbers will change periodically as Toledo Edison tariff rates are updated and adjusted. Estimated community savings are also based upon estimated customer counts (current & potential new participants) and historic annual usage. Actual savings will vary based on changes in these factors.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the refreshed pricing results, Palmer Energy recommends that the NOAC communities execute contracts with Energy Harbor (formerly FirstEnergy Solutions) for a 24-month term beginning with the June 2020 billing period through the May 2022 billing period. The opt-out price will adhere to the “base” price offer structure detailed above, at the highlighted rate of \$0.0457/kWh, and a 25% solar opt-in rate will be available to customers preferring a green option for \$0.0480/kWh.